

# EXHIBIT F

000061

**TUMWATER CITY COUNCIL  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
July 15, 2008 Page 1**

**APPROVED**

**CONVENE:** 6:37 p.m.

**PRESENT:** Mayor Pro Tem Pete Kmet, Councilmembers Neil McClanahan, Judith Hoefling, Ed Stanley, Karen Valenzuela, and Bruce Zeller.

Excused: Mayor Ralph Osgood and Councilmember Joan Cathey.

Staff: City Attorney Karen Kirkpatrick, Finance Director Jim Hendrickson, Planning and Facilities Director Mike Matlock, Associate Planner David Ginther, Senior Planner Tim Smith, and Recording Secretary Danielle Gardea.

**INTERGOVERNMENTAL  
REPORTS:**

**THURSTON COUNTY 911 CAPCOM:** There was no report.  
(Joan Cathey)

**THURSTON COUNTY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL:** There was no report.  
(Joan Cathey)

**TUMWATER UNITED FOR FAMILIES (TUFF):** There was no report  
(Bruce Zeller)

**LOTT ALLIANCE:** Councilmember Stanley attended the last meeting on behalf of Councilmember Zeller. LOTT has developed a new newsletter. Funding for surveillance camera systems at the LOTT facilities was approved. The administrative education center for the water quality laboratory was approved for bidding. Public art will be receiving \$250,000 for facilities. There is a worksession scheduled on July 23, 2008. Councilmember Zeller thanked Councilmember Stanley for attending the meeting in his absence.  
(Bruce Zeller)

**THURSTON COUNTY EMERGENCY MEDICAL SERVICES COUNCIL:** Councilmember Zeller reported Fire Chief Carpenter attended the meeting on his behalf. The next meeting is on July 16, 2008.  
(Bruce Zeller)

**ANIMAL SERVICES COMMISSION:** There was no report.  
(Pete Kmet)

000062

**TUMWATER CITY COUNCIL  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
July 15, 2008 Page 5**

watershed awareness in the community. There are many sponsors this year for the program. He recognized Debbie Smith and the Stream Team for their support. There will be educational booths, children activities, and music

Mayor Pro Tem Kmet presented Brian Walsh with the proclamation.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

**Betsy Murphy, 5243 Bald Eagle Lane SW**, said she wanted to thank the City Council for recognizing the seriousness of protecting manufactured home parks.

**Richard McClure, 5242 Bald Eagle Lane SW**, echoed similar comments.

**Sally Graham, 930 Trosper Road SW**, thanked the City Council for their consideration and for trying to meet the needs of seniors. The residents have tried to emphasize that they are a responsible community who take pride in their homes.

**Dorothy Schelfstrom, 5055 Bald Eagle Lane SW**, said she supports Eagles Landing and has lived there for seven years. She said as a senior citizen, she just wants to keep her home.

**Nancy Castro, 930 Trosper Road SW**, echoed similar comments.

**John Woodring, 2120 State Avenue, Olympia**, said he is the attorney for the Manufactured Housing Communities of Washington State. The organization represents approximately 525 communities in Washington State. He distributed a copy of the organization's position on the matter. The company has some concerns and opposes mandatory Manufactured/Mobile Housing Community zoning. As proposed, the ordinance will require a mandatory manufactured housing overlay zone as an exclusive use of those properties. The organization has a duty to protect property owner rights and the City's approach is illegal and unconstitutional. The organization is also surprised Tumwater is proposing the zoning ordinance. The organization does not consider any Tumwater manufactured home parks at risk of closing or being converted to other uses. Under the Mobile Home Landlord Tenant Act, a park owner may close a community with 12 months notice. There is no jurisdiction in the State of Washington that currently has a Mandatory Manufactured Housing Community (MHC) zone for preserving affordable housing. The City of Everett has a voluntary zone. The organization must protect member rights.

Mayor Pro Tem Kmet commented that the proposed ordinance would be in Mr. Woodring's clients best interest because of the number of tax breaks afforded to property owners of manufactured home parks. Mr. Woodring said they want to protect owner property rights and when the properties were developed they were put into undesirable areas. As areas have developed and improved, owners should have the right to convert the properties to other

000063

**TUMWATER CITY COUNCIL  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
July 15, 2008 Page 6**

uses. On a voluntary MHC zone the owners would be given that option.

Councilmember Stanley said he understands the importance for protecting property owner rights. However, the ordinance protects people who have property located within mobile home parks. Mr. Woodring said that offering a better form of relocation assistance and giving the tenants the opportunity to purchase the park have been successful provisions in the past. The only way an owner is able to terminate a tenancy is with cause with a 12-month notice to the tenant. Under law, there is language on the rental agreement that the community can be closed at any time.

Councilmember McClanahan said that as a member of the Housing Authority he understands both sides of the issue. As the tenants grow older there are complications in moving to another location. Everyone should look at the proposal as an opportunity to work together. Mr. Woodring commented that it is usually the action of local government that dictates the closure of manufactured home park communities.

Mr. Woodring provided examples of alternative solutions to provide protection to tenants of mobile home parks.

**Ishbel Dickens, Attorney for Columbia Legal Services**, said she has worked with manufactured homeowners for over 20 years. Mr. Woodring has advised the Council that no other jurisdictions in the state have regulated mandatory zoning. However, the cities of Renton and Bothell have both adopted MHC overlay zoning to preserve affordable housing. She thanked the City Council for their consideration on this issue.

Councilmember Hoefling said housing is a huge problem. She asked how to involve the community. Ms. Dickens said that co-ops and reduction of property taxes will be a huge benefit.

**CONSENT CALENDAR:**

- a. Approval of Minutes: Worksession, June 16, 2008; Regular Meeting July 1, 2008
- b. The City Council authorizes for payment Voucher/Check # 110734 through #110858 in the amount of \$1,135,364.22
- c. The Plat of Simmons Heights – Tumwater Long Plat – DSD-08-00185; Request for Final Plat Approval
- d. Ordinance No. O2008-018, Latecomers Agreements
- e. Temporary Utility and Well Access and Use Agreements – Black Hills Community Soccer
- f. Contract with Washington State Department of Transportation (WSDOT)

**MOTION:**

**Councilmember Valenzuela moved, seconded by Councilmember Stanley, to approve the consent calendar. Motion carried.**

000064

**TUMWATER CITY COUNCIL  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
July 15, 2008 Page 7**

**COUNCIL  
CONSIDERATION :**

**STRATEGIC AND  
ECONOMIC  
DEVELOPMENT PLANS  
- FUNDING REQUEST:**

Planner Smith reported staff is requesting the Council's approval of additional funding to include projects not within the scope of the current project.

In 2007, the City hired Berk and Associates to prepare a Strategic Plan and Economic Development Plan. The City Council met several times and discussed the development of the Strategic Plan. There was interest in conducting a community survey on the community's interest in future economic development within the City. Staff recommends contracting with a firm that specializes in conducting surveys. Currently, the task is not included within the scope of the project. Staff is seeking the following:

- Utilize \$25,000 earmarked for telecommunication construction from the General Government #3 project for covering the remaining costs for the services of Pendleton Consulting, LLC and to hire a professional survey firm to conduct a scientific community-wide survey. The contract with a survey firm will not exceed \$20,000.
- Commit the General Government portion of the Capital Facilities Plan (CFP) to fund the remaining portion of the contract with Berk and Associates of \$30,000 in the 2009 CFP.

Planner Smith reported staff will provide a briefing to both the Council and the Economic Development Advisory Committee in the fall on the results of the survey.

Mayor Pro Tem Kmet said a community survey is a good gauge on how the residents of Tumwater feel about development.

**MOTION:**

**Councilmember Hoefling moved, seconded by Councilmember Zeller, to approve the funding request as requested by staff. Motion carried**

**COMMITTEE REPORTS:**

**GENERAL  
GOVERNMENT  
COMMITTEE:**

Planner Ginther provided a brief history on the General Government Committee's work on the Manufactured/Mobile Home Parks draft zoning ordinance. The ordinance preserves and protects Manufactured Home Parks. Several points of the discussion included:

- Utility hook-up fees – State law allows utility providers some options for adjusting hook-up fees for qualifying low-income persons.
- Utility rates discount – a 50% discount on water and sewer utility rates is available for those who qualify as low-income seniors.

000065

**TUMWATER CITY COUNCIL  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
July 15, 2008 Page 8**

- Property taxes – The City of Tumwater is facilitating the reduction of property taxes for mobile/manufactured home park owners by rezoning the property. Property owners will need to contact the Thurston County Assessor's Office. Washington State has property tax exemption for residents of manufactured or mobile home parks who own their own homes but not the property it sits on.
- Application of the zone – The ordinance as drafted applies to all 10 mobile/manufactured home parks within the City of Tumwater. Seven are large parks with three smaller parks also meeting the definition of a park with two having only three units on the property.

If the Council approves the proposed ordinance it needs to be referred to the Planning Commission for briefings and a public hearing and then referred to the City Council for a final briefing and public hearing.

**MOTION:**

**Councilmember Stanley moved, seconded by Councilmember Valenzuela, to forward the ordinance to the Planning Commission for consideration and a public hearing.**

Councilmember Valenzuela said Mr. Woodring, the attorney for the landowners, has suggested adopting voluntary zoning. However, voluntary zoning has failed in other communities, which is the primary reason for recommending a mandatory overlay. She suggested looking at the three smaller properties and possibly exempting them from the ordinance and including them on a voluntary basis.

Mayor Pro Tem Kmet asked whether the ordinance is modeled from ordinances from the other jurisdictions. Planner Ginther replied Tumwater's proposed ordinance is different as different uses are allowed in the zoning. Mayor Pro Tem Kmet asked if any of the other ordinances have been challenged. Planner Ginther replied that he is not aware of any lawsuits.

Mayor Pro Tem Kmet said the ordinance should cover the areas that really need to be preserved and may not relate to the smaller parks because of the complaints and disturbances that have occurred previously in the smaller parks.

Mayor Pro Tem Kmet asked whether park owners have been contacted and provided with information. Planner Ginther replied that the owners of the seven large parks are included on the City's mailing list.

Mayor Pro Tem Kmet asked about the intent of the list of conditional uses. Planner Ginther replied Chapter 18.56 covers the requirements for the list conditional uses.

**MOTION:**

**Motion carried.**

000066

# EXHIBIT G

000067



**TUMWATER PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
December 9, 2008 Page 1**

**CONVENE:** 7:02 p.m.

**PRESENT:** Chair Debbie Sullivan, Commissioners Sally Nash, Bill Mandeville, Terry Kirkpatrick, Ed Hildreth, Kathy Goebel, and Marcus Glasper.

Excused: Commissioner Peter Gayton.

Staff: City Attorney Karen Kirkpatrick, Planning and Facilities Director Mike Matlock, Senior Planner Tim Smith, Associate Planner David Ginther, and Recording Secretary Cheri Lindgren.

**APPROVAL OF PLANNING  
COMMISSION MINUTES –  
NOVEMBER 25, 2008:**

Commissioner Hildreth moved, seconded by Commissioner Goebel, to approve the November 25, 2008 minutes as presented. Motion carried.

**CHANGES TO AGENDA:**

There were no changes to the agenda.

**NEXT PLANNING  
COMMISSION MEETING  
DATE – DECEMBER 23,  
2008:**

The next meeting is scheduled for December 23, 2008, if needed.

**COMMITTEE / COUNCIL  
UPDATES:**

Planner Smith reported the City Council will hold a worksession on December 15, 2008 at 7:00 p.m. to discuss the strategic planning project. Draft results of an economic development survey conducted on November 18-24, 2008 will be presented.

The Council will consider the Wayfinding Signage Master Plan at its December 16, 2008 regular meeting.

**OTHER BUSINESS /  
UPCOMING EVENTS /  
CONFERENCES:**

There was no other business.

**WORKSESSION:**

**2008 COMPREHENSIVE  
PLAN AMENDMENTS AND  
ORDINANCE NO. 02008-  
009, MANUFACTURED  
HOME PARK  
DEVELOPMENT  
REGULATIONS AND  
ZONING:**

Planner Ginther reviewed key requests, questions, and issues addressed by the Commission at the November 25, 2008 public hearing. Staff can add new text or change existing language on page 27 of the comprehensive plan amendments and add a new goal and policy in the Housing Plan as outlined in the staff report.

Planner Ginther reviewed pros and cons of retaining or removing page 84 of the comprehensive plan amendments concerning Allimor Carriage Estates as a transitional property because of zoning and location. The Commission could establish an acreage limit, such as 10 acres or a density calculation to exclude the three smallest mobile home parks and Allimor Carriage Estates.

000068



**TUMWATER PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
December 9, 2008 Page 2**

Staff needs to pursue further research to determine density options.

Specific to item 13, Planner Ginther asked for input from the Commission on whether there is a preference of using "space" or "spaces" in section 18.49.050(C), or "lot" or "land."

Commissioner Mandeville suggested the comprehensive plan amendment and ordinance should de-emphasize affordable housing aspects and emphasize statutory language of the Growth Management Act (GMA), such as providing sufficient land for manufactured housing and recognizing manufactured housing as a traditional housing type. Planner Ginther said the changes would need to be reflected on a number of pages in the Land Use Plan, Littlerock Road Subarea Plan, and the Housing Plan. Additionally, the zoning ordinance intent and whereas sections for the 2008 comprehensive plan amendments and the findings for the Planning Commission recommendation and City Council Final Order would need to be changed for consistency.

Discussion ensued on the intent of the proposed changes outlined in item 3. Commissioner Mandeville said the intent is identifying sufficient land for manufactured housing and de-emphasizing the City's goal for manufacture home park owners preserving affordable housing.

Commissioner Mandeville explained that the draft new goal and policy for the Housing Plan refers to statutory language in the GMA. The new goal augments existing language.

In response to a question from Commissioner Kirkpatrick, several Commissioners and Planner Ginther clarified the intent of creating a matching zoning district for manufactured home parks. Commissioner Kirkpatrick suggested replacing "matching" with "new." There were no objections from the Commission.

Commissioner Kirkpatrick suggested replacing "should" with "may" within the second bullet under item 5, a, which would read in part, "May have the effect of reducing the properties valuation..."

Discussion ensued on options for incentives for rezoning or agreements to remain as a manufactured home park, adding a permit requirement to close a park, and adding new requirements to the criteria for a rezone.

Commissioner Mandeville said he forwarded information to staff on what other cities in Oregon use regarding item #7. Staff noted it could take several months to process a permit. Additionally, Oregon laws might conflict with Washington laws. Commissioner Mandeville agreed with staff's recommendation to study the concept. He suggested the Commission ask the Council to include adding a permit requirement on next

000069

**TUMWATER PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
December 9, 2008 Page 3**

year's work plan or docket of comprehensive plan amendments.

Commissioner Mandeville said he agrees with staff's recommendation for item #8 for addressing the issue of rezone criteria as a separate work task.

Commissioner Mandeville referred to item #10 and said his suggestion is retaining existing language for Allimor Carriage Estates as a transitional property and not designating the facility as a Manufactured Home Park (MHP). He acknowledged comments by Dr. John Dunham at the November 25, 2008 public hearing. One issue is whether housing units would be able to relocate to other parks should the owner close the MHP. Allimor Carriage Estates is the only MHP located within a General Commercial (GC) zone.

Discussion followed on item #17 pertaining to the density of the three small parks. Commissioner Kirkpatrick reported that he visited the three smaller parks. He asked why Tumwater did not annex a larger MHP located within a county island across from Rural Road. Planner Ginther explained that an annexation was completed prior to the restriction of creating county islands. Currently, there are a number of county islands within Tumwater. Annexation is subject to referendum and the City is not able to initiate annexation of county island properties and complete it without the residents using the power of referendum to stop the annexation.

Commissioner Kirkpatrick said the three small parks at 6715 Henderson Boulevard, 6911 Henderson Boulevard, and 5012 Rural Road do not meet the spirit of the proposed ordinance. The property owner owns the mobile homes on Rural Road. Although the property is listed as 1.87 acres, the owner also owns two undeveloped parcels totaling approximately one acre abutting 5012 Rural Road. The property owner also owns two mobile homes at 6911 Henderson Boulevard. The site contains a number of other buildings. It's not a typical MHP. The property owner does not own the two manufactured homes at 6715 Henderson Boulevard. That site also contains two single-family homes, a retail store, and two large storage warehouses. The land is not utilized as a MHP. He suggested excluding the three small parks from the ordinance using an acreage threshold or density filter. The three sites don't appear to have a future as MHPs.

Commissioner Mandeville agreed. The challenge is developing criteria to define what's considered a MHP. He agreed with an option of establishing a minimum area, such as 10 acres, which has been pursued by other cities.

Commissioners discussed lot consolidation and a property owner avoiding classification as a MHP by owning two separate but adjoining six-acre parcels if a 10-acre threshold is established.

000070

**TUMWATER PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
December 9, 2008 Page 4**

**MOTION:**

Commissioner Mandeville moved, seconded by Commissioner Goebel, to accept the revision outlined in 3, c, and suggested policy statement 2.2.6 and 2.1.1 as follows:

- **2.2.6 Manufactured Home Park (6-9 DU/Acre).** The Manufactured Home Park (MHP) land use designation is intended to provide sufficient land for manufactured housing in accordance with the GMA.
- **2.1.1 Consider implementing a new land use designation and zoning district to provide sufficient land for manufactured housing in accordance with the GMA.**

Discussion followed on a concise way to move forward the Commission's recommendations.

Planner Ginther advised that staff will incorporate the changes as appropriate within the comprehensive plan and zoning ordinance to align with the goal to provide sufficient land for manufactured housing in accordance with the GMA if desired by the Commission.

**MOTION:**

The makers of the motion withdrew the motion.

**MOTION:**

Commissioner Mandeville moved, seconded by Commissioner Goebel, to incorporate the changes in 3, c and d to reflect the new intent more closely aligned with the GMA by identifying sufficient land for manufactured housing and to promote a variety of housing types.

Commissioner Nash asked for clarification regarding "sufficient land." Commissioner Mandeville said the Housing Plan discusses the City's future housing needs. It's projected that by 2022 Tumwater will need approximately 512 additional manufactured housing units. Currently, the City has 579 units. The City will need to identify other locations appropriate for MHPs.

**MOTION:**

Motion carried unanimously.

**MOTION:**

Commissioner Mandeville moved, seconded by Commissioner Glasper, to add goal #13 and the policy/objective statements listed in the staff report into the Housing Plan of the comprehensive plan stating:

- **GOAL #13: Ensure consistency with RCW 36.70A.070(2)(c) which requires sufficient land be available for all types of housing including manufactured housing.**
- **Policy – Objective – 12.1. Designate areas specifically for manufactured home parks in order to provide sufficient land for manufactured housing.**

000071

**TUMWATER PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
December 9, 2008 Page 5**

- **12.1.1. Consider creating a new zone district for manufactured home parks to ensure implementation of the MHP designation.**

Commissioner Hildreth asked whether the City currently has sufficient zoning for all types of housing. Planner Ginther affirmed there is sufficient zoning for different types of housing. Commissioner Hildreth asked whether the recommendation could be viewed as redundant as the motion incorporates changes in 3, c and d.

**MOTION:**

**Commissioner Mandeville moved, seconded by Commissioner Glasper, to amend the motion and revise 12.1 to read in part, "Designate areas specifically for manufactured housing in parks in order to ..."**

It was noted that the Policy – Objective statements should be numbered 13.1 and 13.1.1 rather than 12.1 and 12.1.1. Planner Ginther acknowledged the correction.

**MOTION:**

**The amendment to the motion carried unanimously.**

**MOTION:**

**The motion as amended carried unanimously.**

It was noted future work is needed for items 7 and 8 to add a permit requirement to close a park and add new requirements to the criteria for a rezone.

**MOTION:**

**Commissioner Glasper moved, seconded by Commissioner Kirkpatrick, to use "land" instead of "lot" (item 13). Motion carried.**

Commissioner Mandeville referred to pages 8 and 9 of the proposed ordinance and offered the following changes:

- 18.49.020, Permitted Uses, C., to read "Mobile home parks, which *are equal to or greater than 10 acres* and that were legally established prior to July 1, 2008;
- 18.49.050, Density Regulations, add a new #1 under A to read, "The minimum size is equal to or greater than 10 acres," and renumber items 1 and 2 appropriately.

Commissioner Kirkpatrick suggested the third paragraph on page 22 of the Land Use Plan should be changed to read in part, "Mobile and manufactured home parks which were legally established prior to adoption of this plan and have an area of 10 or more acres..." Commissioner Mandeville responded that there are likely other areas in City plans that would require the same change if approved.

000072

**TUMWATER PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
December 9, 2008 Page 6**

**MOTION:**

**Commissioner Mandeville moved, seconded by Commissioner Goebel, to amend section 18.49.020, Permitted Uses and section 18.49.050, Density Regulations, as outlined above.**

Commissioner Hildreth said he's not supportive of establishing a size threshold and will oppose the motion. A property owner should have the option to develop property within the law regardless of its size. The criterion of three or more mobile/manufactured homes is a good threshold.

Commissioner Glasper asked whether the proposed changes restrict establishing new MHPs in the Multi-Family Medium (MFM) zone. Planner Ginther said there are differing regulations in the MFM. A manufactured home park in the MFM would not be automatically designated MHP.

Commissioner Nash asked whether other zoning districts have minimum acreage requirements. Planners Smith and Ginther responded that there is an acreage threshold for the Business Park zone.

Director Matlock said specifying a size threshold in the permitted uses section is cumbersome. Establishing criteria on when to apply the MHP zone is appropriate.

Commissioner Kirkpatrick reiterated that another option is to establish a density threshold, such as two dwelling units per acre. Planner Ginther pointed out those densities less than four units per acre are scrutinized because they're not considered urban density lots.

Commissioners shared their opinions on a size limit:

- A size threshold encourages MHP owners to be serious about sustaining the park. A significant investment is required. A site with two units does not demonstrate the same level of investment.
- A minimum size might be appropriate for new MHPs. An advantage of establishing a size limit when designating existing MHPs in the City is unclear.
- The staff report spoke about tax reductions for MHPs. There might be other advantages as well.
- The proposal applies to the 10 current MHPs in the City. Identifying a size requirement does not affect the existing MHPs.

Commissioner Kirkpatrick said the three small parks don't fit the role of a MHP and a filter is needed to exclude them from the proposed action. It appears using an acreage limit works better than establishing a density regulation. Planner Ginther said the Commission has offered good reasons to exclude the four parks (the three small ones and Allimor) without utilizing a filter because they don't meet the intent a MHP and don't

000073



**TUMWATER PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
December 9, 2008 Page 7**

represent a long-term investment. Allimor Carriage Estates is an older park within a transitional area and the only site zoned GC.

City Attorney Kirkpatrick said staff has a good sense of the Commission's intent regarding MHPs, as well as, reasons to include or exclude existing mobile/manufactured home parks. Staff could revise the ordinance accordingly. The Commission could vote on a concept on why the three small parks should not be included in the MHP classification based on the reasons already articulated.

**MOTION:**

**Motion failed. Two Commissioners voted for and four opposed.**

**MOTION:**

**Commissioner Glasper moved, seconded by Commissioner Nash, to have staff forward Ordinance No. O2008-009 with the understanding that the intent of the Commission is excluding the 3 small parks because they do not meet the intent of the proposed ordinance, as well as the Allimor Carriage Estates property because it's a transitional property.**

**MOTION:**

**Commissioner Hildreth moved, seconded by Commissioner Goebel, to amend the motion and exclude Allimor Carriage Estates.**

Commissioner Nash said Allimor Carriage Estates is zoned GC, which is a good reason to exclude it rather than its transitional land use status.

**MOTION:**

**The amendment to the motion carried. Commissioner Mandeville opposed.**

**MOTION:**

**The motion as amended carried.**

Commissioner Kirkpatrick asked staff to incorporate changes to the ordinance as appropriate in the Land Use Plan.

**MOTION:**

**Commissioner Goebel moved, seconded by Commissioner Glasper, to exclude Allimor Carriage Estates because it's currently zoned GC, which is outside the parameters of what the Commission considers a MHP.**

In response to a request from Commissioner Hildreth about other reasons to exclude Allimor Carriage Estates, Commissioner Kirkpatrick said a MHP is a residential area and belongs in other residential areas and not completely surrounded by a commercial zone.

Commissioner Goebel added that health, peace, welfare, and quality of life for Tumwater citizens are dependent on where housing is located, which should not be in the vicinity of a commercial area.

000074

**TUMWATER PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
December 9, 2008 Page 8**

**MOTION:**

**Motion carried unanimously.**

In response to a question from Commissioner Mandeville, Planner Ginther advised that staff will align the whereas sections in the ordinance and findings of fact and conclusions to reflect the recommendations of the Commission.

**MOTION:**

**Commissioner Hildreth moved, seconded by Commissioner Glasper, to recommend approval of the 2008 comprehensive plan amendments with the changes requested to the City Council. Motion carried.**

**MOTION:**

**Commissioner Mandeville moved, seconded by Commissioner Goebel, to recommend approval to the City Council of Ordinance O2008-009, Manufactured Home Park Development Regulations and Rezone as amended. Motion carried. Commissioner Hildreth abstained.**

**BRIEFING:**

**OUTDOOR LIGHTING  
STANDARDS:**

Planner Ginther briefed the Commission on outdoor lighting and drafting lighting standards to reduce unwanted effects of improperly directed outdoor lighting and glare. It has been awhile since the issue was under consideration. Commissioners were asked to view exterior lighting on homes, businesses, offices, and industrial uses prior to the next meeting.

Planner Ginther said light pollution is any adverse effect of artificial light whether from sky glow, glare, light trespass, light clutter, or decreased visibility at night. He provided and reviewed a number of photographs with lights producing large amounts of glare and misdirected light creating potentially unsafe conditions. Examples of good lighting locally using full cut off fixtures (no part of the light or lens hangs down below the edge) were also shared. Well-designed, fully shielded fixtures that direct all light downward onto the ground have far less glare. Flag illuminating light will also be addressed in a future ordinance because it contributes to sky glow.

Louvers are an effective means to help eliminate glare. Streetlights along Tumwater Boulevard are not fully shielded. Streetlights are not included in the ordinance. City Hall is not exempt from up lighting. The newer decorative pedestrian plaza lights use internal shields.

An example of the stadium lighting at the Falls Terrace Restaurant was presented. Commissioners might want to consider some exemptions relating to business properties.

Discussion ensued on light pollution as it relates to businesses in Tumwater, Valley and enforcing a lighting ordinance when the City isn't able to enforce other ordinances. Planner Ginther advised that the City does not have a dedicated code enforcement officer. New development would be

000075



**TUMWATER PLANNING COMMISSION  
MINUTES OF MEETING  
December 9, 2008 Page 9**

required to meet the ordinance. Staff will suggest implementing an educational program and a 10-year compliance requirement.

Commissioner Hildreth reported business lighting in Tumwater Valley is not compliant and nothing has been done to gain compliance. The *National Geographic* magazine recently published an excellent article on preserving night skies.

**ELECTION OF OFFICERS  
FOR 2009:**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Hildreth moved, seconded by Commissioner Goebel, to elect Debbie Sullivan as the 2009 Planning Commission Chair. Motion carried.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Goebel moved, seconded by Commissioner Glasper, to elect Ed Hildreth as the 2009 Planning Commission Vice, Chair. Motion carried.

**CANCEL DECEMBER 23,  
2008 MEETING:** The December 23, 2008 meeting was cancelled.

**ADJOURNMENT:** Commissioner Glasper moved, seconded by Commissioner Kirkpatrick, to adjourn the meeting at 8:56 p.m. Motion carried.

Prepared by Cheri Lindgren, Recording Secretary  
Puget Sound Meeting Services

000076